



# MIPA

# Yearbook

# Evaluation

**School** \_\_\_\_\_

**City** \_\_\_\_\_

**Yearbook Name** \_\_\_\_\_

**School's Classification** (circle one)    **A**    **B**    **C**    **D**

To have your school's yearbook evaluated, your school must be a current member of MIPA.  
MIPA, 305 Communication Arts Building, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824-1212  
Phone: 517.353.6761  
Web: [www.mipa.jrn.msu.edu](http://www.mipa.jrn.msu.edu)  
E-mail: [mipa@msu.edu](mailto:mipa@msu.edu)

# OVERVIEW OF EVALUATION

Yearbooks are undergoing a period of extreme change. Cluster captions, scatter-story and modular design and wild graphics pervade the professional media, particularly media aimed at young people. Traditional quote/transition/quote copy is being replaced by alternative copy. We cannot continue to produce formula books. At the same time, we cannot ignore or minimize state mandates to teach journalism basics. We have taken this delicate balance into consideration in designing this book.

This **Yearbook Evaluation Form** is designed to provide a framework for the judge in evaluating the book, to reward the staff for creativity and accomplishment and to provide suggestions for improvement for future books. We have tried to make this guide as open-ended as possible to allow the judge to consider all factors: sound journalism, reader expectations, community traditions and marketing needs.

We do not want to promote cookie-cutter yearbooks. We want to allow staffs as much latitude as possible in producing yearbooks that fit their school and community as well as reflect sound journalism practices. This evaluation is designed to provide meaningful feedback and to recognize and reward excellence.

With this in mind, we award the following ratings:

## **Spartan Award**

925 or more

## **Gold Award**

800 or more

## **Silver Award**

700 or more

## **Bronze Award**

0-700

### **NOTE TO JUDGES:**

Please rank each category according to the scale provided and assign the appropriate number of points. Please use the space provided for suggestions and comment that will help the staff understand concerns and problem areas and how they may be improved. Please use a pencil to score.

Traditionally, yearbooks have had themes, usually in the form of a catch phrase with mini-themes for each section. Though themes remain popular, many staffs are experimenting with more conceptual approaches. These concept books may employ logos, typography, artwork or textures to create a unifying element. Whatever form the unifying concept takes, it serves as the thread that holds the book together to present a coherent history of the year.

- Book has a clear unifying concept in the form of a theme, a graphic, a logo, spin-offs or a similar element that creates an overall impression and personality.
- Unifying concept is apparent through its appearance in such places as on the cover, end-sheets, title page, in the opening and closing and on the dividers.
- Unifying concept is original, imaginative and relevant to readers for the particular year.
- Design of theme/concept pages is distinctive, reflecting both understanding of design and contemporary influences.
- Theme/concept pages employ photographs with complete captions that reinforce unifying concept.
- Theme concept pages contain copy that develops unifying concept as well as containing details that mark the year.

**Judge's Comments on Unifying Concept:****Score for Unifying Concept:**

**0**                      **60**                      **70**                      **80**                      **100**  
**Needs Improvement**      **Average/Good**      **Very Good**      **Excellent**

In general, coverage should reflect the diversity of the school population and the effort to cover all individuals. Coverage should be personalized through strong photos and direct quotes. It should be balanced and well-rounded with the emphasis placed on what makes this year different from others.

## STUDENT LIFE

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school.
- Coverage gives reader a complete overview of entire year, including both special events and everyday life in and out of school. Feature topics are fresh and help the reader appreciate the personality of the school.
- Coverage focuses on student involvement in and reaction to events.
- Coverage employs strong action photos rather than posed shots.
- Stories amplify coverage through specific details, active voice and meaningful student quotes.
- Complete captions add to the story and show evidence of research.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.

## PEOPLE

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school.
- Coverage includes all grade levels, faculty, administration and support personnel.
- Feature topics with related candid photos enhance coverage in the section. Stories amplify coverage through specific details, active voice and meaningful student quotes.
- Faculty section lists specific courses taught and extracurricular positions with portraits.
- Section includes list of not pictured.
- Section avoids use of baby pictures and mock elections except as part of journalistic feature coverage.
- Complete captions add to the story and show evidence of research.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.

**CLUBS/ORGANIZATIONS**

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school.
- Coverage gives the reader a complete overview of club, including routine events as well as special events and activities.
- Coverage topics are interesting and innovative rather than telling goals or purpose of club and listing officers.
- Coverage employs strong action photos rather than posed shots.
- Stories amplify coverage through specific details, active voice and meaningful student quotes.
- Complete captions add to the story and show evidence of research.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.
- Group photos with complete indents are included here or elsewhere in book such as index or ad section. Group photos are not dominant element.

**ACADEMICS**

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school.
- Coverage gives the reader a complete academics overview, including core courses, electives and vocational courses.
- Coverage concentrates on student rather than faculty involvement.
- Coverage topics are interesting and innovative rather than repeating curriculum purposes and/or listing course descriptions.
- Coverage employs strong action photos rather than posed shots.
- Stories amplify coverage through specific details, active voice and meaningful student quotes.
- Complete captions add to the story and show evidence of research.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.

**SPORTS**

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school. Coverage gives the reader a complete sports overview, including women's sports, jv and freshman sports, intramural (where applicable) and individual sports.
- Coverage topics go beyond the obvious to show team accomplishments, struggles and triumphs throughout the year. Copy avoids editorialized comments on season and predictions for next year.
- Coverage employs strong action photos rather than posed shots.
- Stories amplify coverage through specific details, active voice and meaningful student quotes.
- Complete captions add to the story and show evidence of research. They name everyone in photo, including opposing team players, and tell outcome of pictured play as well as outcome of game.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.
- Scoreboard is included listing win-loss record and overall record.
- Team photos with complete idents are included here or elsewhere in book such as index or ad section. Team photos are not dominant element.

**ADVERTISING/COMMUNITY**

- Coverage is appropriate for size of book and size of school.
- Coverage gives the reader a complete community overview. National and international events are covered somewhere in the publication, emphasizing local angles and student involvement.
- Ads are placed in such a way that small ads are contrasted with larger ads, creating visual contrast.
- Sidebars, secondary stories, infographs and other secondary features add to coverage.

**NOTE TO JUDGE:** Please adjust points for books without advertising. Books should not be penalized for lack of advertising section.

**Judge's Comments on Coverage:****Score for Coverage:**

<b>0</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>250</b>	<b>350</b>	<b>400</b>	
<b>Needs Improvement</b>		<b>Average/Good</b>	<b>Very Good</b>	<b>Excellent</b>	

One of the main purposes for the yearbook is to serve as a historical record of the year. It is impossible to tell the story through photos alone. We must observe, interview, report and write journalistically to make the story complete. Stories and captions need to be descriptive, well researched and unified.

### **COPY (refers to both traditional and alternative copy)**

- Writing reflects obvious research and evidence of interviews. It employs clear angles.
- Strong, varied leads capture readers' attention.
- Copy comes alive through use of meaningful student quotes with proper attribution.
- Copy avoids editorial comment, use of school name, year and mascot.
- Copy is generally written in past tense using third person and active voice.
- Effective transitions, short sentences and short paragraphs aid readability.
- Copy shows evidence of careful editing and proofing.
- Copy observes journalistic rules.

### **HEADLINES**

- Headlines are relevant to spread content without being labels. They are clever, imaginative and not cliché.
- Headlines grab and pull the reader into copy both through content and placement.
- Secondary headlines add to content by providing details for reader.
- Headlines and secondary headlines are set in an appropriate size to enhance design.

**CAPTIONS**

- Every photo has a caption.
- Captions show evidence of research and answer all the readers' questions without stating the obvious or editorializing.
- Captions use active voice and avoid structures such as **is running, is playing** and **Pictured above (below, left, right) is Laurie Stein**.
- In general, captions contain at least two sentences. The first sentence explains the action of the photo and is written in present tense. Subsequent sentences are written in past tense.
- Captions employ varied leads, avoiding name leads and overuse of verbals.
- Captions identify everyone pictured with complete names but do not use **left to right**. Group photos use **Front row...Second row...Back row**.
- Captions show evidence of careful editing and proofing and observe journalistic rules.
- A distinctive caption style adds to section design.

**Judge's Comments on Writing:**

**Score for Writing:**

**0**                      **50**                      **75**                      **100**                      **125**  
**Needs Improvement**      **Average/Good**      **Very Good**      **Excellent**

Though design continues to go through a period of experimentation, the basic aims remain. First, the design should attract the reader to the spread. Second, design should make the spread contents easy to digest.

- Each section has a distinct design with pages designed as double-page spreads that employ apparent spread linkage.
- Spreads generally use a columnar, grid or modular plan which presents elements in a logical, imaginative and well-planned manner that encourages eye movement.
- Each spread contains a dominant element.
- Spreads employ consistent, sufficient external margins and effective use of white space.
- Action in photos travels toward the gutter rather than off the page.
- Portraits are uniform and arranged in rectangular panels with names to the outside.
- Faces are not trapped in the gutter.
- Use of odd-shaped photos and collages has been avoided.
- When used, graphic elements are well planned and executed, adding to the presentation.
- Copy, captions and headlines fit space allotted and are set in attractive, readable type.
- Special typographical effects such as initial letters and display type enhance readability and attractiveness of spreads.
- Type sizes and leading is consistent within section.

**Judge's Comments on Design/Graphics/Typography:**

**Score for Design/Graphics/Typography:**

**0                    100                    140                    160                    200**  
**Needs Improvement      Average/Good      Very Good      Excellent**

Photos make or break the yearbook. It's vital that they accurately tell the story of the year. To do this, they must have both strong content and technical quality.

- Photo content concentrates on action and has strong story-telling ability. Photos with students mugging for the camera or photos of back or tops of heads are avoided.
- Photos have strong center of visual interest.
- Cropping emphasizes center of interest and eliminates wasted space.
- Photos show an understanding of composition elements such as rule of thirds, framing and leading lines.
- Spreads include a variety of photo content.
- Special effects are used sparingly and for a purpose.
- In group photos, subjects are arranged in easily-identifiable rows with recognizable faces and empty space cropped out.
- Center of interest is clearly in focus.
- Photos are free of scratches, waterspots and fingerprints.
- Photos have good contrast and minimum grain.

### **Judge's Comments on Photography:**

#### **Score for Photography:**

**0**                      **50**                      **75**                      **100**                      **125**  
**Needs Improvement**      **Average/Good**      **Very Good**      **Excellent**

Reader services are all the little things that make it easier for us to navigate through the book.

- Cover introduces unifying concept and includes name of book and year.
- Spine includes name of school, city, state and volume number.
- Title page connects to unifying concept and includes name of book, volume number, year, school name, complete address and telephone number. It may include student population, faculty population, athletic conference and web address.
- Table of contents is provided, accurately listing first page of main section dividers and index. Placement is on endsheet or page 2-3 but not on title page.
- Folios appear on at least one page of every spread. Folio tabs identify specific page contents.
- Book includes a complete, accurate index which includes students, faculty, activities, organizations, sports, academic areas and advertisers. The index is set in a readable type and size.
- The book includes a colophon placed after the index but not as part of the closing. It includes technical aspects of the book and printing as well as a listing of the yearbook staff and adviser. It may include press association memberships and previous awards. Acknowledgments are tastefully presented.

**Judge’s Comments on Reader Services:**

**Score for Reader Services:**

**0**                      **25**                      **35**                      **40**                      **50**  
**Needs Improvement**      **Average/Good**      **Very Good**      **Excellent**

# THE FINAL ANALYSIS

CATEGORY	TOTAL POINTS	
Unifying Concept (10 percent)	_____	
Coverage (40 percent)	_____	
Writing (12.5 percent)	_____	
Design/Graphics/Typography (20 percent)	_____	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Spartan Award</b>
Photography (12.5 percent)	_____	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Gold Award</b>
Reader Services (5 percent)	_____	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Silver Award</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>_____</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Bronze Award</b>

## SUMMARY COMMENTS:

\_\_\_\_\_

SCHOOL \_\_\_\_\_

JUDGE'S SIGNATURE \_\_\_\_\_